

Mr Robert Stuart

[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]

Our Ref: 2751936

8 August 2014

Dear Mr Stuart

BBC One, Panorama: Saving Syria's Children, 30 September 2013
BBC One, Ten O'Clock News, 29 August 2013
BBC One, Ten O'Clock News, 30 September 2013

Thank you for writing to the BBC Trust about the edition of Panorama, *Saving Syria's Children* and two items in the 10pm bulletins which included footage from that edition of Panorama and which were also published on BBC News Online. I am sorry that you were unhappy about elements of the programme and the news reports and that you feel the BBC has not given you a proper response to your complaints.

The Trust is the last stage of the complaints process and everyone who works within the Trust Unit is outside the day-to-day operations of the BBC. We review the complaints that come to us to assess whether they should be put before the BBC's Trustees for them to reach a final decision. If you want to find out more about how the complaints system works – and in particular about how the BBC Trust fits in – this is the web link:

http://www.bbc.co.uk/bbctrust/governance/complaints_framework/

In deciding which ones should be considered by the Trustees, we look at the merits of the complaint and only those which stand a reasonable chance of success are passed to Trustees. The Trust acts in the interests of all licence fee payers and it would not be proportionate to spend a good deal of time and money on cases that do not stand a realistic prospect of success. The link that I have given above gives more information about this.

I am sorry to send a disappointing response, but I do not believe your appeal should be put in front of Trustees. The BBC's journalists and programme-makers are expected to work to a high standard; those standards are set out in the BBC's

Editorial Guidelines¹ which underpin all BBC output. I have looked at your appeal in relation to those Guidelines. This means I have assessed if the points you have raised can be judged against the standards set down in the Guidelines. I have attached with this letter a summary of your appeal as well as the reasons behind my decision. As this Annex may be drawn on when the committee minutes are written, the writing style is formal: your name does not appear, and you are described as the complainant. While I regret the impersonal feel of this, I hope you will appreciate that it protects your own privacy as well as helping the Trust to work efficiently.

If you disagree with my decision, you can ask the Trustees to review it by contacting the Complaints Advisor, at trust.editorial@bbc.co.uk or at the above address, by **26 August 2014**. You should state your reasons, which will need to demonstrate clearly to Trustees why, contrary to my decision, your complaint stands a reasonable prospect of success. Please send your reasons by this deadline in one document if possible.

We may not consider any correspondence received after that, so if, exceptionally, you need more time please write giving your reasons as soon as possible.

If you do ask the Trustees to review this decision, I will place that letter as well as your original letter of appeal and this letter before Trustees. Your previous correspondence will also be available to them. They will look at that request in their September meeting. Their decision is likely to be finalised at the following meeting and will be given to you shortly afterwards.

If the Trustees agree that your case has no reasonable prospect of success then it will close. If the Trustees disagree with my decision, then your complaint will be passed back to the Executive for a further response.

Yours sincerely

Natalie Rose
Senior Editorial Strategy Adviser

¹ <http://www.bbc.co.uk/guidelines/editorialguidelines/guidelines/>

Annex 1

BBC One, Panorama: Saving Syria's Children, 30 September 2013

BBC One, Ten O'Clock News, 29 August 2013

BBC One, Ten O'Clock News, 30 September 2013

The Trust's Editorial Appeals procedure states that:

The Trust will only consider an appeal if it raises "a matter of substance".² This will ordinarily mean that in the opinion of the Trust there is a reasonable prospect that the appeal will be upheld as amounting to a breach of the Editorial Guidelines. In deciding whether an appeal raises a matter of substance, the Trust may consider (in fairness to the interests of all licence fee payers in general) whether it is appropriate, proportionate and cost-effective to consider the appeal.³

Complaint

In the summer of 2012 a BBC team travelled to Syria with two British doctors who were working with the charity Hand in Hand for Syria, to bring medical care to the war-affected region. This is the programme billing on the BBC website:

In a special edition, Panorama travels with British doctors inside Syria to exclusively reveal the devastating impact of the war on children caught in the conflict. The doctors witness the aftermath of the bombing of a school by a suspected napalm-like incendiary device and medical facilities constantly under attack - both war crimes under international law. Filmed in the north of the country after the chemical weapons attack in Damascus which inflamed world opinion and brought America, Russia and the UN to the table, the film shows how the conventional war is intensifying with children bearing the brunt of this humanitarian catastrophe.

The complainant alleged that sequences depicting the aftermath of the incendiary bomb attack contained "a large degree of fabrication".

The two news reports included in the appeal were items about the incendiary attack, which used material shot by the Panorama team and which also largely appeared in the documentary.

In its response at Stage 2, the Editorial Complaints Unit (ECU) advised it was incorporating into one response the allegations concerning the reports which

² Under the Charter and Agreement, the Trust has a role as final arbiter in appropriate cases, and must provide a right of appeal in cases that raise a matter of substance.

³ For example, if an appeal raises a relatively minor issue that would be complicated, time-consuming or expensive to resolve, the Trust may decide that the appeal does not raise a matter of substance, and decline to consider it.

appeared on the Ten O'Clock News and the allegations about Panorama. The same approach was adopted for this decision.

None of the issues raised by the complainant were upheld at Stage 1 or Stage 2.

Appeal

The complainant appealed to the BBC Trust on 11 June 2014. The complainant appealed on the substance of his complaint, that, in his view, the programme had breached its own and Ofcom's guidelines in the following ways:

Right of reply and fairness

The BBC has made the supremely serious allegation that the Syrian government has deliberately targeted schoolchildren with an incendiary device, yet has at no point requested or published a response from the Syrian government as required by section 6.4.25 of the BBC Editorial Guidelines and section 7.11 of the Ofcom Broadcasting Code.

Misleading audiences

'Saving Syria's Children' breaches section 3.4.16 of the BBC Editorial Guidelines in the misleading chronology presented in its first half, the editing out of all chronology of the scenes of the "napalm bomb" "victims" from 30:38 onwards and, above all, in the staging of an atrocity.

The complainant asked the Trust to review the decision of the ECU not to uphold his appeal. He also asked for points he had raised in previous correspondence to be considered and included some additional information to support those points.

The Adviser considered allegations concerning the following points from the complainant's appeal and his previous correspondence (some have been grouped where the Adviser considered it made sense to do so):

1. Right of reply and fairness:

1.1. The programme failed to provide a right to reply to the Syrian Government.

2. Misleading audiences:

2.1. There were problems with the date and victims attributed to the incident, which was proof that it was staged. These included:

2.1.1. Discrepancies between the date in the Panorama programme and the date on a third party website

2.1.2. Internal inconsistencies in the date Panorama presented as the date of the alleged attack

- 2.1.3. Discrepancies in images of victims between Panorama and third party output
- 2.1.4. Inconsistencies between Panorama's claim that the attack happened at 5.30pm and third party pictures taken outdoors in daylight
- 2.2. Material was broadcast out of chronological sequence in the Panorama programme and this was evidence that the episode had been fabricated.
- 2.3. An audio edit of an interview with a Doctor was misleading.
- 2.4. There were discrepancies between the Panorama account and a third party account of the first victim to arrive at hospital, which suggested the incident had been fabricated.
- 2.5. The nature and severity of the injuries of some of the victims seemed to be fabricated.
- 2.6. There was a discrepancy between the casualty figure given in Panorama and elsewhere.
- 2.7. The location of the attack appeared to be a private home and not a school, which suggested the incident had been fabricated.
- 2.8. There had been recycling of costumes between two "actors", which suggested the incident had been fabricated.
- 2.9. The affiliations between one of the Doctors, her charity, and the Syrian Opposition Movement were not scrutinized.

Decision of the Senior Editorial Strategy Adviser

The relevant correspondence was reviewed by the Trust Unit. The Senior Editorial Strategy Adviser (the Adviser) watched the relevant programme and news reports. An Independent Editorial Adviser also reviewed the relevant output, read the correspondence and carried out further research. The Adviser acknowledged the strength of the complainant's feelings, but considered the appeal did not have a reasonable prospect of success.

1. Right of reply and fairness

The Adviser noted the allegation in the complainant's appeal to the Trust that the programme had failed to provide a right to reply to the Syrian Government. However, the Adviser also noted that under paragraph 1.5 of the Editorial Complaints and Appeals Procedure, fairness complaints can only be made by a first party complainant, or by someone who has the authority to represent them.

The Adviser considered that, as the complainant did not have authority to complain on behalf of the Syrian Government, he could not bring a complaint about the fairness of not offering the Syrian Government a right of reply. Therefore, the Adviser considered that, were this allegation to proceed to appeal, it would not have a reasonable prospect of success and she did not propose to put it before Trustees.

2. Misleading audiences

The Adviser noted the detailed investigations carried out by BBC Complaints at Stage 1 and the ECU at Stage 2 and their respective reasoning for rejection of the complaint. The Adviser noted the ECU had viewed all of the rushes of the incident filmed by the Panorama team in considering its decision at Stage 2.

The Adviser reviewed the allegations and responses; additional questions were put to the ECU about the nature and content of the rushes prior to the Adviser reaching her decision. The Adviser noted that the complainant had been provided with a full transcript of the Panorama programme by the ECU when it issued its provisional finding at Stage 2.

The Adviser decided the question for her to consider was whether, on the balance of probabilities, taking into account all the available evidence, there was any reason to believe the incendiary bomb incident was staged, or there was any other reason to believe the BBC output in question was not duly accurate.

The Adviser considered each of the complainant's accuracy allegations in turn:

2.1. There were problems with the date and victims attributed to the incident, which was proof that the incident was staged:

2.1.1 There were discrepancies between the date in the Panorama programme and the date on a third party website

The Adviser noted the complainant's allegation that a set of images taken by a freelance photographer had appeared on a third party website (Demotix) which had originally suggested that the incident had happened a day earlier than was stated in the Panorama programme.

The Adviser investigated the Demotix website, and noted that it currently shows the date of its images as 26 August 2014, i.e. the same date given by the Panorama team for the incident. The Adviser also noted that the Facebook page of the photographer who filmed the images had a posting dated 28 August in which the photographer said the incident happened two days earlier, i.e. 26 August.

The Adviser noted that in his letter of appeal the complainant rejected the ECU's invitation for him to supply evidence that the Demotix photographs were published before 26 August, the date of the alleged attack:

"I have already provided evidence that they were originally published dated 25 August; it is incumbent upon the BBC to provide proof this was not the date of their publication on Demotix. Clearly this matter can only be settled by accessing the metadata of [the photographer]'s original photographs.

Demotix refuses to respond to me; a request from the BBC may be received differently."

The Adviser noted the only evidence for the earlier date for his images was from what the complainant said were screenshot captures of the Demotix website which he made in December 2013 which are no longer available. The Adviser also noted evidence supplied by the complainant, that he wrote on 16 December 2013 to Demotix to inquire about the upload date and time of those images and that Demotix had declined to respond on the matter.

The Adviser did not consider there was any justification for a direct approach to Demotix as suggested by the complainant as she did not consider the detail of a now corrected error which it is alleged appeared on a third party website was a legitimate matter for investigation in the context of this complaint.

The Adviser took the view that, given the photographer's Facebook posting, even if the complainant was right about the original date on the Demotix website, it could reasonably be concluded that Demotix had simply posted the wrong incident date when the photographs were uploaded onto their site and, having been alerted to the error, had changed the images to reflect the correct date.

Therefore, the Adviser considered that, were this allegation to proceed to appeal, it would not have a reasonable prospect of success and she did not propose to put it before Trustees.

2.1.2 The Panorama programme was internally inconsistent in how it presented the date of the alleged attack

The Adviser noted the allegation that the Panorama programme was internally inconsistent in how it presented the date of the alleged attack: that according to one reference in the narrative it would have been 26 August, and to another it would have been 29 August.

The Adviser noted the ECU's explanation of the apparent discrepancies, having reverted to the Panorama team:

In the course of the programme, the doctors were variously filmed in a refugee camp, delivering food aid to villages, visiting a frontline clinic run by Hand in Hand for Syria and treating victims of the attack on the school. The programme did not purport to present a neat, chronological timeline where every event shown followed the one that had been shown previously.

Mr Pannell has confirmed that his "journey" began on 23 August 2013. The visit to the frontline clinic occurred on the morning of 26 August (not 23 August as you have assumed) and when Mr Pannell said "Four days later we see the area being pounded by the Syrian air force" he was referring to a return trip he made to the area on 30 August without the two doctors. When he said at 17.48 "The next morning, we moved to a village..." the footage showed children at the refugee camp and Mr Pannell was referring back to the previous sequence from the camp which was featured at the start of the programme (filmed on 23 August). The "next morning" was therefore 24 August. I accept that you may have found this confusing but I hope I have been able to explain why there was no discrepancy in the timeline of what Mr Pannell and Mr Conway filmed and when.

The Adviser noted the complainant's rejection of the ECU's explanation in his letter of appeal:

This is incorrect. The section from 17:35 to 18:22 does not show "children at the refugee camp", it plainly shows children at the village well. There is therefore no reference whatsoever to the "camp which was featured at the start of the programme", either in the narration or the visuals, and therefore no indication that the "next morning" does not follow on from the immediately preceding footage of rebel casualties arriving at the frontline clinic. Indeed Mr Pannell describes the village (17:48) as being "a few miles west of the front line", strongly suggesting proximity to the clinic.

The Adviser noted the relevant section of commentary (key sentences in bold):

REPORTER

*On the both sides of the divide children are becoming orphans and refugees. **The next morning we move to a village a few miles west of the frontline. It's home to hundreds of families who've been uprooted.** 11-year-old Wahda joins the scramble at the village well for dwindling resources.*

WAHDA subtitles

Bashar Assad orphaned these kids.

There's no-one to raise them now.

He killed them.

He destroyed our houses and burned them.

The Adviser noted the complainant's view that the section did not show children at a refugee camp but rather at the village well. The Adviser considered a less literal translation of a refugee camp than that understood by the complainant was necessary. The commentary made it clear that the children at the well were orphans and had been uprooted. Therefore while it may have been a village, the location now also served a wider purpose, as a temporary home (refugee camp) for those uprooted in the conflict. The commentary made it clear that the newcomers –

whose homes had been destroyed – were having to share scarce resources with the villagers.

The Adviser considered the complainant had been given an adequate and credible explanation for what might at first have appeared to be an inconsistency in the timeline of the Panorama programme. She did not think that the way that programme had been presented was misleading in this regard.

The Adviser concluded Trustees would be of the view that that this allegation did not provide any reliable evidence to support the assertion that the timeline in the programme was misleading. The Adviser therefore did not consider this aspect of the complainant's complaint had a reasonable prospect of success, and she did not propose to put it before Trustees.

2.1.3 There were discrepancies in images of victims between Panorama and third party output, and this suggested the incident had been fabricated

The Adviser noted the complainant's allegation that photographs of the Panorama victims at a different hospital (taken by Demotix) was evidence that the incident had been fabricated.

The Advisor noted that there had been some initial confusion in the correspondence about whether the Demotix images were of the same victims as had appeared in the BBC coverage. The Adviser noted the Demotix images were taken at a different hospital, Bab al-Hawa, which may have been the reason the BBC team initially to conclude they portrayed different victims. However, the Adviser observed that the hospital where the Demotix pictures were taken was just two miles from the Turkish border, and that it was stated in the Panorama programme that some of the victims from the hospital where the Panorama team had been filming had been taken to Turkey for specialist treatment. As the incident happened close to a lightly-equipped frontline "field hospital" it would seem reasonable to conclude that the casualties may have stopped off at an intermediary hospital en route, such as Bab al-Hawa.

The Adviser therefore agreed with the ECU's explanation for the Demotix images of the individuals:

It is my opinion that at least some of the individuals photographed by [the freelancer] at the Bab al-Hawa hospital were also filmed by the BBC at the hospital in Syria. I think that is clear from a study of the relevant material. I am aware that Mr Pannell has previously offered a different view but I do not believe that undermines the credibility of the material filmed by the BBC at the Hand in Hand for Syria hospital or can be regarded as evidence that the victims were not genuine.

The Adviser therefore did not consider Trustees would be of the view that that this allegation provided any reliable evidence to support the assertion that the incident had been fabricated. The Adviser did not consider this aspect of the complainant's

complaint had a reasonable prospect of success, and she did not propose to put it before Trustees.

2.1.4 Panorama's claim that the attack happened at 5.30pm was inconsistent with third party pictures taken outdoors in daylight

The Adviser noted the complainant's view that Panorama's claim that the attack happened at 5.30pm was inconsistent with several of the images in the Demotix pictures which were taken outdoors in daylight.

However, the Adviser understood from the ECU investigation that there is daylight footage in the BBC rushes of hospital staff discussing the transfer of patients to hospitals in Turkey and shots of an ambulance waiting outside the hospital at the same time. The Adviser therefore concluded that Trustees would be of the view that the daytime images of victims were not inconsistent with the material filmed by the BBC, nor could they be regarded as evidence that the BBC material was faked.

The Adviser concluded that were this allegation to proceed to appeal it would not have a reasonable prospect of success, and she did not propose to put it before Trustees.

2.2 Material broadcast out of chronological sequence was evidence that the episode had been fabricated

The Adviser noted the complainant's contention that a number of instances in which material was broadcast out of chronological sequence was evidence that the entire episode had been fabricated.

The Adviser noted the allegations concerned the following observations by the complainant:

- the same victims were shown on more than one occasion out of chronological sequence, as evidenced by their dress and their behaviour
- identical scenes were shot from different angles suggesting either two cameras or different "takes", as in a film
- a woman in a black dress was seen arriving twice at the hospital
- a chair appeared to have moved from its original position in successive shots

The Adviser also noted the complainant's view that the doctors' movements during a 10 minute section of the Panorama programme were presented as a chronological sequence, but that the lack of continuity in times of day, clothing and locations suggested otherwise.

The Adviser noted section 3.4.16 of the Accuracy guideline discussing Production Techniques (relevant sections only):

There are very few recorded programmes that do not involve some intervention from the production team, but there are acceptable and

unacceptable production techniques. Consideration should be given to the intention and effect of any intervention. It is normally acceptable to use techniques that augment content in a simple and straightforward way for example by improving clarity and flow or making content more engaging... It is usually unacceptable to use production techniques that materially mislead the audience about the reality of the narrative or events.

For news and factual content, unless clearly signalled to the audience or using reconstructions, we should not normally:

- *inter-cut shots and sequences to suggest they were happening at the same time, if the resulting juxtaposition of material leads to a misleading impression of events.*

Commentary and editing must never be used to give the audience a materially misleading impression of events or a contribution

The Adviser noted the second Stage 1 response:

There is no chronological detail in the editing of the film or the news piece that misleads. The editing has been done to show the mayhem and the mood of what was happening around. This event happened in a 4 to 5 hour period and everything that was filmed happened within that time frame, but not everything was edited in exact chronological order other than the start and end of the day. At no point does this mislead or change the context of the event. What filmed is what happened. The context, scale, or events shown have not been changed or altered because the order of the edit is not in keeping with the chronological time frame.

The Adviser noted the response from the reporter via BBC Complaints in response to the specific allegation that there appeared to be multiple takes in the same location:

There were many victims being treated in this room so we were trying to film them all, which obviously means filming from different angles and of course at slightly different times. During these times they are moved around from bed to bed, have different treatment, all of which is chaotic ... We do not stay in one place at all times and as you can imagine we also had to try and stay out of the way of the doctors and nurses when they required us to so they could do their work... We were moving around capturing many different things all of the time so he we could try and show the story that was unfolding around us.

The Adviser noted that the BBC accepted the footage had been broadcast out of sequence on a number of occasions. However, the Adviser considered that this was justified by the chaotic scene that the programme was trying to capture. The Adviser was not of the opinion that the editing decisions in the programme had misled the audience. For this reason, the Adviser concluded that were this allegation to proceed

to appeal it would not have a reasonable prospect of success, and she did not propose to put it before Trustees.

2.3 An audio edit of an interview with a Doctor was misleading

The Adviser noted the complainant's allegation that an audio edit of an interview with Dr Hallam (who featured in the output), in which some of her words were edited out, was misleading. The Adviser observed that because the Doctor was wearing a medical face mask throughout the interview the programme had been able to edit out some of her words without the audience being able to notice, because there was no need to resort to a "cut-away" edit shot to avoid a jump cut in the vision.

The Adviser noted that the editing had resulted in only a very minor change to the image that appeared on the screen at the point a certain word was spoken, and that the programme team had chosen to make this change because Dr Hallam referred to a "*chemical weapon*" when it was known by the time of broadcast that the bomb was an incendiary device. The Adviser considered that the change would have had no effect on the audience's understanding of what was happening at the time, and she considered that the change was editorially justified.

The Adviser believed Trustees would be likely to agree that there was no evidence that the editorial decision to edit the audio of Dr Hallam in the way it had was likely to have resulted in viewers being misled and she therefore decided that the allegation would not have a reasonable prospect of success were it to proceed to appeal. She did not propose to put it before Trustees.

2.4 There were discrepancies between the Panorama account and a third party account of the first victim to arrive at hospital

The Adviser noted the complainant's allegation that in an interview given by one of the British doctors to ABC Radio in Australia three months after the incident she suggested that the first victim to arrive at the hospital was a boy who was covered in "strange white dust", and that this contradicted information in the Panorama programme. The Adviser noted that in Panorama, and by the complainant's acknowledgement "in several other accounts", the first victim was a baby.

The Adviser was of the view that one inconsistency between the Panorama programme and an interview of unknown accuracy, given on a different network, after the event, did not raise sufficient evidence that the BBC content was not duly accurate.

The Adviser concluded that Trustees would be likely to be of the view that this allegation also did not provide any reliable evidence that BBC output was inaccurate or misleading.

2.5 The nature and severity of the injuries of some of the victims seemed to be fabricated

The Adviser noted the allegation from the complainant's Stage 2 submission:

It is self-evident that the section of the BBC News report of 29 August from 03:02 to 03:19, in which the tableau of male alleged victims are static and quiet until spotting that the camera is on them, at which point (03:05) they begin to groan and writhe in unison, is fabricated...

If one of the hospital scenes is staged, presumably they all are.

The Adviser noted the complainant's assertion that the BBC was obliged to investigate and to solicit independent medical opinion regarding the following:

- a baby claimed to have 80% burns by Dr Hallam did not appear in the images to have suffered severe burns; they would have covered his whole body and be unmistakable
- the baby's father seemed entirely unscathed but a BBC News report described him as "also burnt ... sat helplessly on a stretcher clutching his son"; Dr Hallam described him as having had a burnt face.
- the eyebrows of alleged victims are pristine, despite white cream suggesting treatment for facial burns
- a reference in the programme to victims having been burnt by a "napalm-type" substance was implausible in light of the demeanour of the victims; napalm, according to sources from Vietnam "is the most terrible pain you can imagine"
- the plausibility or deterioration of alleged injuries to a number of named victims; teenagers who allegedly died appeared amongst the least injured
- injuries to the hands of two of the victims had the appearances in both cases of a prosthesis.

The Adviser noted that:

- Panorama made no specific reference to the extent of the baby's burns, the reference to 80% burns was made by Dr Hallam in a debate organised by Save the Children.
- The ECU had confirmed that the rushes show that the individual described by Panorama as the baby's father had sustained some burns.

Contrary to the suggestion that victims had not suffered damage to their eyebrows, the reporter had related to BBC Complaints that he could smell burnt hair and flesh and there were ashes on the hospital beds from the hair of some of the victims, but on other victims their eyebrows were not burnt.

- The commentary made clear the substance was not napalm, but something like napalm.
- With regard to the deterioration of the teenagers, the ECU had provided a credible explanation that *"the effect of a burn can go well beyond damage to the skin. Muscle, bone and tissue can all be affected and subsequent pain can be caused by injury to surrounding nerves. Significant damage can be caused to airways which may not be apparent. Depending on the location and severity of the injury, burns can also cause life threatening complications. Hospitals specialising in burns frequently have intensive care units and sterile areas where the risk of infection and fluctuations in temperature can be carefully controlled to help prevent infection..."*

Burns of this nature get worse as time goes by, not only do they affect the outside but whatever was inhaled affects the inside organs as well, causing severe internal burns."

- The complainant had not provided any evidence to support his claim that the hands of two of the victims had *"the appearance... of prosthesis"*.

The Adviser was of the view the complainant had not raised sufficient evidence to support his allegation that the footage broadcast by Panorama had been fabricated.

The Adviser noted that the cameraman and the reporter were both BBC employees, with considerable experience in the region and in war reporting. She noted that the ECU had spoken at length to the reporter and was confident that he had no reason to doubt that what he was witnessing was the aftermath of a genuine and horrific incident. The Adviser noted also that the material was filmed in a conflict zone. The degree of sophistication that would be required to have staged an incident such as this for the benefit of the cameras, and to have deceived such an experienced team, would, in the Adviser's view, likely have been impossible on the frontline of an ongoing conflict.

Therefore, the Adviser believed Trustees would be likely to agree with the ECU's conclusion that there was no substantive evidence of fabrication, and overwhelming evidence to the contrary that what the Panorama team had witnessed was genuine.

2.6 There was a discrepancy between the casualty figure given in Panorama and elsewhere

The Adviser noted the complainant's allegation that there was a lack of clarity across the media as to the numbers injured. The complainant asserted that most reports had put the number of fatalities as between eight and ten students or children, but

that it was not clear, across the media, whether these were of people who had died at the scene, or later as a result of their injuries. The complainant also referred to quotes from Dr Ahsan (one of the two doctors filmed by Panorama) in third party media, in which she gave slightly different figures to those in Panorama itself.

The Adviser noted the programme's response to this allegation:

As far as we were aware three died instantly at the scene – we were shown the crisp, blackened corpses. A further seven died either on their way to hospital or once in Turkey. It is possible more may have died subsequently. More than thirty were injured. The figure was given to us by the hospital at the time. We know some of the victims did not come to this particular hospital and so the actual figure is probably higher.

The Adviser noted the guideline on Accuracy requires that BBC output is well sourced, based on sound evidence, thoroughly tested and presented in clear, precise language. The Adviser noted the team had witnessed for themselves the immediate aftermath of the event, had seen some of the fatalities with their own eyes and had followed their initial visit up with a subsequent visit to Turkey to try to ascertain what had happened to some of those who had been injured. At least one of those victims, Siham Kanbari, who was alive at the time of that visit, according to information in the correspondence for this complaint, subsequently died. She would not have been one of the ten included in the figure of fatalities in the commentary in the Panorama programme. The Adviser noted too that the BBC did not suggest a number in its output of those injured overall, and that the fatalities noted were those known to the team at the time the Panorama programme was broadcast. The Adviser considered there was nothing to suggest the way in which the programme and related BBC output had reflected the casualty figure was not duly accurate, based on what was known at the time.

The Adviser therefore concluded that were this allegation to proceed to appeal it would not have a reasonable prospect of success.

2.7 The location of the attack appeared to be a private home and not a school, which suggested the incident was fabricated

The Adviser noted the complainant's allegation that the location of the attack appeared to have been a private home rather than a school, and that this suggested the event had been fabricated. The Adviser noted the information provided to the complainant at Stage 2:

My understanding is that the vast majority of schools in Syria have shut down as a result of the ongoing conflict within the country. Many students have not been to school for many, many months. Some private schools have been set up and these are often run from any available premises. In this case I have been informed that the venue was a residential home hired by the headmaster and his colleagues, and they were holding summer courses at the time of the attack

The Adviser considered that the BBC had explained why the school in the programme appeared to be a private home, and did not consider the complainant had provided evidence to support his contrary assertion.

The Adviser therefore concluded that were this allegation to proceed to appeal it would not have a reasonable prospect of success.

2.8 *There had been recycling of costumes between two "actors", which suggested the incident was fabricated*

The Adviser noted the complainant's allegation that:

"Two different women at the Hand in Hand hospital are filmed wearing the same black dress with the distinctive gold flower pattern, and seemingly also the same blue headscarf.

The older woman is seen rushing through the hospital gate at around 36 minutes in Panorama with a man claiming to be her father (they in fact appear of similar age) and proceeds to engage in a bizarre combination of mournfulness and angry ranting. In the very next scene, in what the BBC has stated is chronologically earlier footage, she is seen being transported by stretcher from an ambulance into the hospital.

The younger woman is featured from 0:17 in this Al Jazeera video [a link was attached] where her words are translated "...all I saw was people on fire, I was on fire, my friends were on fire", presumably indicating that she is intended to represent a student at the alleged school. The younger woman also appears in the longer of the two You Tube videos you cite, from 01:35 to 01:52, 02:16 to 2:20 and 04:35 to 04:40.

Why would two different alleged victims share the same clothes? Was the Hand in Hand hospital operating a "wardrobe department"?

The Adviser noted that there had been some confusion at stages 1 and 2 about whether the complainant was suggesting that the same woman in the black dress had been shown arriving twice at the hospital, or that two different women had been wearing the same clothes. However, she noted the following assertion from the complainant's letter of appeal to the Trust:

My point... is not whether they are the same person – they are not – but why it should be that they are wearing not merely similar, but identical dresses and headscarves. My suggestion, which I had plainly stated, is that this was a costume recycled among the amateur actors used in the fabricated episode.

The Adviser therefore considered the allegation she should consider was whether the same clothes had been worn by two amateur actors, and whether this was evidence that the events shown in the Panorama programme had been fabricated.

The Independent Editorial Adviser viewed the relevant sequences in the Panorama programme and also the YouTube footage, and reported her findings to the Adviser. Whilst the Adviser was of the view that the third party footage from Al Jazeera was not relevant to her consideration of the allegation that BBC output was inaccurate, having viewed the material on YouTube, she understood that it was clearly the same individual who appeared in all three sequences, contrary to the complainant's assertion in his letter of appeal. Therefore neither the third party footage nor the sequences which appeared in the Panorama programme offered any evidence to support the assertion that there were two female actors who had swapped costumes and that this was evidence that the incident had been fabricated.

The Adviser therefore concluded that this allegation would be unlikely to succeed should it proceed to appeal.

2.9 The affiliations between one of the Doctors, her charity, and the Syrian Opposition Movement should have been scrutinised

The Adviser noted the complainant's allegation that the backgrounds of both Dr Hallam and the Hand in Hand charity were "worthy of scrutiny":

Why has the BBC at no point in its coverage... felt it necessary to inform its viewers of the pro-Syrian opposition affiliations of Dr Hallam and of her charity Hand in Hand for Syria?

The Adviser also noted the complainant's allegation that Dr Hallam's father had links to the Syrian opposition. He pointed to an article written by Dr Ahsan in February 2013 that an article written by Dr Ahsan in February 2013 states that Dr Hallam's father is "involved politically with the Syrian National Council".

The Adviser noted the ECU's response in its provisional finding at Stage 2:

I think it was implicit that the charity was working in an area of Syria controlled by the opposition and would therefore be likely to share its aims and objectives (as opposed to supporting the Syrian government). Secondly, there were various comments from Dr Hallam which would have left the viewers in little doubt as to where her sympathies lay. For example, at the end of the day of the attack, she said:

"I feel so angry right now, I feel so, so angry. The whole world has been watching us for two and a half years. We feel like some sort of, not even a second class citizen, like we just don't matter, like of all these children and all of these people who are being killed and massacred, we don't matter. The whole world has failed our nation and it's innocent civilians who are

paying the price. It's an absolute disgrace on the United Nations and all of humanity.

I do not believe you have presented any persuasive evidence to support your claim about Dr Hallam's father and I would regard any such evidence as circumstantial at best and of no relevance to any assessment of your complaint. I would add, though, that the political affiliations of Dr Hallam and her father, whatever they may be, are immaterial to the facts of what occurred and to the question of whether those facts were reported accurately."

The Adviser noted the following sections of commentary from the programme, particularly how they helped signpost for the audience Dr Rola Hallam's personal interest in the conflict (beyond her medical role). The Adviser noted too how the commentary signposted that the film was shot entirely in rebel-controlled areas:

- In the first few minutes of the programme, Dr Hallam is introduced thus:

Rola's family is from Syria and she lived here as a child.

- A few minutes later reporter Ian Pannell states:

By travelling with the doctors I'm hoping to see the humanitarian crisis through their eyes – but we can only film their work in rebel held areas.

- Dr Hallam refers to Syria in the possessive:

...the last couple of years the focus has been so much on trauma and war injuries that actually everything else had gotten forgotten. And now, we found ourselves like two and a half years down the road, our whole healthcare system has essentially been destroyed

The Adviser noted too how the reporter explained the context in which the filming was taking place: that the violence was not only from the Government side, or only perpetrated by the Government on rebel-held areas. She noted the following amongst many such examples and wider context which were included in the commentary throughout the programme:

- *The war in Syria is now in its third year. Sectarian differences and extremism have taken hold on both sides. And the conflict threatens the stability of the region...*
- *Rival rebel factions now fight each other as well as the government*
- *On the both sides of the divide children are becoming orphans and refugees.*

The Adviser considered that no evidence had been produced that Dr Hallam had either formal or informal links to the Syrian opposition. The Adviser considered the

audience had been accurately informed that Dr Hallam was of Syrian extraction and agreed that viewers would have been able to judge for themselves on the basis of Dr Hallam's contributions in the programme, where her loyalties might lie. Contrary to the complainant's contention, the Adviser was not aware of any information that had been withheld from the viewer which required to be included.

The Adviser considered also whether there was any evidence to support the complainant's implicit allegation that the Hand in Hand charity was formally linked to the Syrian Opposition, such that the programme was obliged to mention the fact in order to achieve due accuracy and due impartiality. The fact that the charity was founded by members of the Syrian diaspora did not, in the Adviser's view, provide any information to support the allegation.

The Adviser also thought it likely Trustees would agree with her that, regardless of whether Dr Hallam's father had any links to the Syrian opposition or not, his political allegiances were not a relevant consideration in deciding whether facts were presented accurately in the programme.

The Adviser was of the view that the programme had referred to Dr Hallam's beliefs and those of the Hand in Hand charity in a duly accurate manner in the programme, and she saw no evidence to suggest that the audience had been misled in that regard.

The Adviser therefore concluded that there would be no reasonable prospect of success were this allegation to proceed to appeal.

For all the reasons above, the Adviser concluded that were this complaint to proceed to appeal, Trustees would not be likely to conclude that the events presented had been fabricated. She therefore did not consider the appeal had a realistic prospect of success and did not propose to put it before Trustees.

Annex 2 - Post-production script – Saving Syria’s Children

Doctors working in refugee camp	10.00.00	MUSIC
	10.00.03	NARRATOR Two British Doctors, 2000 miles from London are on a mission to bring relief to the suffering of Syria’ children.
Doctors working with children	10.00.12	WOMAN They don’t have any baby ones. They’ve given me a big fat giant one.
Shots in clinics	10.00.16	NARRATOR Working for a British charity, setting up clinics inside Syria for families who don’t have access to medical care.
	10.00.26	WOMAN This baby needs to be picked up. Are you the dad?
Soldiers firing guns outside Street battle People fleeing in vehicles	10.00.37	NARRATOR The civil war has triggered the greatest humanitarian disaster of this century.
Devastated town	10.00.44	A third of the entire population has been forced from their homes.
CU shots children	10.00.49	Beyond the reach of most international aid agencies.
MCU Rola in refugee camp	10.00.55	ROLA I dare any one of them to come and spend one single day in this camp,. To live, just one day.

Man carrying child to hospital	10.00.02	NARRATOR Working in hospitals they witness the dangers faced by local staff.
Shots in clinic	10.01.07	WOMAN All the babies are coming down.
	10.01.09	WOMAN There's a very loud bang. That sounded quite close.
	10.01.13	WOMAN Aah you're waking up.
Doctor working with baby in incubator	10.01.16	NARRATOR They see first-hand how their lifesaving work is giving hope to the most vulnerable.
	10.01.22	WOMAN Those little fingers are so small.
Man carrying injured child into hospital Walking wounded children	10.01.26	NARRATOR And witness the truth about the war's child casualties - a shocking attack on a school.
	10.01.33	SAL I think there's been some kind of chemical attack. There are dozens of people who have just been rushed in covered in burns and some white powder or dust. Their clothes are hanging off them.
MCU Sal in hospital		
Injured child in clinic		

CU woman outside	10.01.46	WOMAN The whole world has failed our nation. And it's innocent civilians who are paying the price.
Woman silhouetted against sky		
TITLE SAVING SYRIA'S CHILDREN A Panorama Special Fade to black	10.01.56	
Doctors walking towards refugee camp	10.02.03	MUSIC
Pan across refugee camp Caption: #bbcpanorama	10.02.16	NARRATOR This is Atma Camp in Syria, right on the border with Turkey and the prospect of sanctuary.
Barbed wire around camp	10.02.24	But the gates are closed and the people here can't travel the final few metres to safety.
Shots of children in camp	10.02.32	For two and a half years, Syria's been at war and millions are on the move. Half of them are children.
MCU Rola in camp	10.02.40	ROLA Approximately 20000 people here mostly women and children and it has just grown massively since the very first time I came.
Shots of doctors in camp	10.02.51	NARRATOR These two British doctors are here with Hand in Hand for Syria, the UK charity that helped set up the camp, now the largest inside Syria.
Shots of Rola in camp with children	10.03.01	ROLA

I've got about 17 people trying to hold my hand...my adopted children little munchkins....

	10.03.10	NARRATOR Rola's family is from Syria and she lived here as a child.
	10.03.14	Now she's an intensive care doctor in London, specialising in paediatric medicine.
	10.03.20	ROLA Unfortunately, a lot of kids have started to have horrible nightmares, some that are crying inconsolably some that scream some that have gone mute.
Shots of Sal in camp with children	10.03.31	NARRATOR Saleyha is an A&E doctor at Queen's Hospital in Essex. She's volunteered in war zones before but none of them compare to Syria.
	10.03.40	SAL Kids are, I'm sure that despite best efforts by their mums, are filthy, their hair's matted with dust and dirt.
Rola in camp with children	10.03.48	ROLA subtitles OK then, who likes the toilets?
Shots of Sal in camp with children	10.03.53	SAL You can see all these temporary ditches being dug - draining from the latrines, It's summer and it's hot - perfect incubation environment for disease.

Rola in camp with children	10.04.07	ROLA I was asking the kids if they like the camp. Funnily enough it was a resounding no.
Children in camp	10.04.12	MUSIC
	10.04.14	NARRATOR It's a tough place to grow up. Even harder to be newborn here. Every tent holds a tragic story.
Baby crying Women and child waiting outside tent INT Ahmed's tent with family	10.04.24	Ahmed's six-year-old daughter was killed, his home destroyed by government warplanes. His wife was pregnant at the time with twins.
	10.04.33	AHMED subtitles The tent feels like hell inside. Babies should not be living in a tent.
CU Ahmed		
Shots of babies	10.04.38	NARRATOR The girls are just a few weeks old.
	10.04.41	AHMED subtitles We don't have electricity or baby milk. We don't have cash, we don't have anything. Only God knows what will happen.
CU Ahmed Shots of doctors, children and adults in camp	10.04.58	NARRATOR I've been reporting from Syria for two years.
	10.05.01	By travelling with the doctors I'm hoping to see the humanitarian crisis through

		their eyes – but we can only film their work in rebel held areas.
	10.05.11	Our journey begins just two days after the chemical attack in Damascus.
	10.05.17	Over two million people have left Syria, almost five million are refugees in their own country,. That's nearly a third of the population made homeless.
Mid shot over tops of tents MCU Ian Pannell PTC in camp Caption: Ian Pannell	10.05.31	IAN PANNELL You would normally expect to see a lot of big foreign charities working in places like this, but because the country has become so dangerous, very few of them dare to tread across the border, meaning people are now desperate for any kind of aid or medical support.
Shots of doctors walking along road	10.05.45	MUSIC
	10.05.51	NARRATOR Despite the risks – Rola and Saleyha have been asked by their charity to check up on the hospitals it runs.
	10.05.58	It's trying to provide regular healthcare in places where the medical system's collapsed.
Shots of Mahmoud being admitted to hospital as emergency	10.06.13	WOMAN His name's Mahmoud? Mahmoud where does it hurt?
	10.06.17	NARRATOR

		Mahmoud has been in a car crash. He shows signs of brain injury.
	10.06.21	WOMAN Ooh. That's a nasty bump.
MCU Rola	10.06.25	ROLA Everyday life stuff still happens, you know, road traffic accidents still happen and the last couple of years the focus has been so much on trauma and war injuries that actually everything else had gotten forgotten. And now, we found ourselves like two and a half years down the road, our whole healthcare system has essentially been destroyed
Shots of treatment of Mahmoud just admitted with injuries	10.06.50	SAL OK, we'll, some painkillers will be helpful. Can I get some IV paracetamol? Paracetamol? No Paracetamol? You don't have paracetamol?
Shots in clinic	10.07.05	SAL He's had a tumble and a fall and a bang to the head. If he was with me at Queens he would be going for a CT scan.
	10.07.11	MUSIC
Child in clinic Wounded child carried in	10.07.11	NARRATOR But this isn't Queens in Essex – it's a hospital in Aleppo province – we can't say exactly where because clinics have been targeted by

Shots of children in clinic Mahmoud being treated	10.07.27	government forces and on occasion shot at by rebel troops. There's no scanner here and Mahmoud will have to be moved.
MCU Rola in clinic Rola talking to man	10.07.27	ROLA We've got no phone connection to speak to the receiving hospital and they tend to only really receive war injuries. So there was a bit of a discussion about whether we can do that or not.
Mahmoud being taken out of the clinic and put in vehicle	10.07.42	NARRATOR Eventually a vehicle's found – it's not so much an ambulance as a transit van.
	10.07.48	SAL Not the most comfortable way to go. It's a sponge mat on the bottom of an empty van". Who's travelling with him?
	10.07.57	ROLA One of the emergency nurses. I'm actually giving them our trauma kit.
	10.08.04	NARRATOR Rola wants to assess what the clinics on the ground need. She has the first item.
CU Rola	10.08.09	ROLA It seems we need an ambulance.
Shots of Mahmoud in vehicle	10.08.13	NARRATOR In a system overwhelmed by war injuries – civilian cases aren't a priority. And in

		the end, Mahmoud doesn't get his brain scan.
Doctors walk across flat roof with drying red chillies	10.08.28	NARRATOR The doctors are heading deeper into Syria, where the needs are greater – but so too are the dangers.
	10.08.34	It's the first time Saleyha will have gone this far into the country.
Shots of Rola and Sal discussing	10.08.39	SAL Should I be worried?
	10.08.42	ROLA The area does get shelled from the air. Sometimes every night sometimes every other night.
	10.08.47	SAL One of the doctors said "We're afraid from the sky".
	10.08.50	ROLA Yeah. Absolutely. Absolutely. The very nature of being here is unpredictable.
Armoured vehicle moving across terrain	10.08.56	MUSIC
LS smoke rising from behind hill	10.09.00	NARRATOR We're heading to the rebel held parts of the north...
Man firing gun Handheld shots in combat zone, dodging fire etc		IAN PANNELL There a vehicle coming, let's go.

	10.09.04	NARRATOR ...an area I've reported from often in the past.
	10.09.8	It's a dangerous patchwork of territory – that constantly changes hands.
	10.09.14	The Syrian government says it's rooting out terrorists and foreign fighters.
Aircraft Bomb explodes on ground Aircraft dropping bombs	10.09.18	Bombing rebel bases.
	10.09.21	But its air campaign means civilian areas are heavily pounded.
Building hit by bombs Rola and Sal walking in town - they get into a car	10.09.32	The doctors want to see what medical care is available for children closer to where the fighting is.
Rola and Sal in car with flak jacket	10.09.39	SAL Flipping heck..
		ROLA What are you doing?
	10.09.42	SAL Trying to handle this flipping thing. I can't move!
		ROLA No, you can't move, you won't be able to breathe but you'll be safe.
		SAL Yes.
Shots filling up at petrol station	10.09.57	NARRATOR There are reports of fighting ahead – and the team's security guards are worried..

Rola talks to woman through car window	10.10.02	ROLA subtitles Don't just say it's bad. Give me details.
	10.10.07	WOMAN What did they say?
		ROLA They are concerned about safety for the location we are going to.
Soldiers cocking weapons	10.10.10	MUSIC
Ian Pannell gets into vehicle with security team	10.10.18	NARRATOR Western journalists have been targeted in Syria - so I travel with my own security.
Shots of car journey	10.10.26	The Doctors are able to be more low key and take their own vehicles.
	10.10.33	The war in Syria is now in its third year.
	10.10.36	Sectarian differences and extremism have taken hold on both sides. And the conflict threatens the stability of the region.
Tracking shots wrecked town	10.10.47	IAN PANNELL Travelling around Syria has never really been more dangerous, both foreign journalists and foreign aid workers have been targeted, some have been killed.
MCU Ian Pannell in car PTC Tracking shot from car		We are just going through a checkpoint now, put the camera down a bit.
MCU Ian Pannell in car PTC		
Shots of passing through checkpoint	10.11.02	NARRATOR Rival rebel factions now fight each other as well as the government. Lawlessness prevails and areas that were once safe

can become dangerous almost overnight.

	10.11.12	IAN This is an ISIS group, the Islamic State of Iraq and Syria. This is a group that is affiliated with Al Qaeda. Increasing numbers of Jihadist have come into Syria, they are setting up checkpoints so it means that any foreigners in particular traveling around the country, run the gauntlet of these checkpoints every few miles or so.
MCU Ian Pannell in car PTC Tracking shots from car		
MCU Ian Pannell in car PTC	10.11.37	The worst thing about driving around is that you are never sure what lies behind the next corner.
Tracking shots from car Rola and Sal in car Tracking shots from car	10.11.40	MUSIC
	10.11.50	NARRATOR The doctors have heard that the frontline clinic is short on paediatric supplies.
Rola and Sal in car Tracking shot from car	10.11.55	ROLA I just wanted them to get a sense of what is there what are they providing what are they not providing.
Rola and Sal in car	10.12.02	No idea what we're going to see because we've been hearing a huge amount of shelling overnight from surrounding areas, so...
Tracking shots from car	10.12.12	NARRATOR As they get closer it's clear the reports of fighting are accurate..
	10.12.16	SAL

		What did the guy at the checkpoint say?
		ROLA
Rola and Sal in car		The road that we are meant to be taking is being closed off because TNT barrels have been dropped on it all morning, er, has destroyed the route and it's now closed off.
Tracking shot from car	10.12.30	SAL
		And that was just from this morning?
		ROLA
		Yeah, from an hour ago.
Rola and Sal in car		SAL
		OK.
	10.12.36	ROLA
		We could have been on that road an hour ago.
Tracking shot from car	10.12.38	MUSIC
	10.12.43	NARRATOR
		The route to the frontline goes through Saraqeb, a town that's been consistently targeted by government forces because rebel fighters have used it as a base.
	10.12.53	IAN PANNELL
MCU Ian Pannell in car PTC		We were hearing on the local radio from the fighters that they could see a helicopter up in the sky, it's just dropped what is frankly the largest bomb creating the biggest explosion I've

Tracking shot from car		seen in two years of covering Syria.
Fire engine		
Security men in car		
Tracking shot from car		
Shots at scene of explosion	10.13.14	NARRATOR The barrel bomb was dropped from a helicopter – what it hit wasn't a rebel base at all – but the local courthouse.
Undercranked shot clouds over town	10.13.23	Media activists have filmed similar attacks on the town.
Helicopter flying... ... it drops a bomb	10.13.27	In the centre of the screen you can see one of these TNT barrel bombs tumbling to the ground.
LS buildings...	10.13.33	Deadly and also indiscriminate.
Bomb explodes		
Tracking shot from car through devastated town		
INT wrecked house	10.13.46	It's not surprising so many have fled their homes.
Tracking shot from car		
Security men get out of car	10.13.56	As our convoy arrives at the frontline clinic a fighter jet is spotted overhead.
People on ground pointing at plane		
Plane in sky		
People taking cover along road	10.14.02	We're told to take cover....
MCU Sal under cover	10.14.08	SAL Apparently they is a MiG flying above us and I have been told to go and run and get under tree – It's a kind of tiny tree, but I can't see it, I can hear it, I can't see it.
MCU Rola by building with ambulance parked outside	10.14.20	ROLA very nervous, everyone is very agitated. We can see smoke just up the road behind us. Everyone is telling us to get

			in, get the cars off the road. Try and get out of here as soon as possible.
Doctors in clinic corridor with child (Abdul Malik)	10.14.43	NARRATOR	Abdul Malik recites the Koran for the doctors. His dad's the surgeon here and with no school to go to, the eight year old spends his day watching casualties come through the doors.
	10.14.54	ROLA	You want to be a doctor when you grow up? Because I want to save people.
		MX	Inshal'allah.
Child in clinic	10.15.03	MUSIC	
	10.15.03	NARRATOR	This is the only place around where sick children can get help.
Medicines shelf with vial	10.15.09	ROLA	This is their entire paediatric supply of medication.
Rola with medicines shelf			20-odd bottles similar to, to paracetamol, along with a not very useful medication. It's not an antibiotic, it's, it's not going to save a life basically. Nor is a Painkiller.
Patients in clinic	10.15.29	SAL	Is he working through the night?
	10.15.32	NARRATOR	It's not just medicine that's in short
Shots of Rola and Sal with doctors			

in hospital

supply. There are few willing to work here and those that are get little time off.

10.15.43

ROLA

They've all been on call for the last 18 days continuously, no rest, living in the hospital. Can't go home, too many people arriving, not enough of them.

LS Hit with smoke rising from the other side

10.15.53

MUSIC

High shot road
Helicopter in sky
Bombing shots
Shots of casualties brought to clinic

10.15.56

NARRATOR

Four days later we see the area being pounded by the Syrian air force.

10.16.13

The being overrun with casualties;

10.16.18

Rebel fighters wounded on the frontline.

Shots of wounded man in clinic

10.16.32

NARRATOR

Blood bags in fridge
Shots of doctor giving blood

Supplies are so short that the medics were giving blood to keep their own patients alive.

10.16.38

DOCTOR subtitles

We have a man injured in the belly.
He's bleeding badly.
He needs blood.
So I am donating my blood.
because I have the same blood group.
All these men are here to donate blood.

10.16.55

IAN PANNELL

What's it like working in this hospital?

10.16.58

DOCTOR subtitles

We're working in very tough conditions.

		Jets can bomb us at any time.
Hospital shots Night sky over clinic Shots in clinic at night Mosque at sunrise Man on guard with gun Shots of children singing	10.17.00	MUSIC
	10.17.26	NARRATOR Children are at the forefront of this conflict.
	10.17.31	MUSIC
	10.17.31	NARRATOR They've sung, protested and even fought in the war....
Shots of people drawing water from well	10.17.40	On the both sides of the divide children are becoming orphans and refugees.
	10.17.48	The next morning we move to a village a few miles west of the frontline. It's home to hundreds of families who've been uprooted.
	10.17.59	11-year-old Wahda joins the scramble at the village well for dwindling resources.
CU Wahda	10.18.05	WAHDA subtitles Bashar Assad orphaned these kids. There's no-one to raise them now. He killed them. He destroyed our houses and burned them. There is no hope of returning.
Shot of closed school	10.18.21	MUSIC

	10.18.26	NARRATOR Thousands of schools have been closed since the war began.
Shots of children living in school	10.18.30	Children used to come here to study, now they live here - as displaced families make homes of classrooms.
Shots of parcels being delivered	10.18.40	NARRATOR Rola is delivering the charity's food parcels just up the road from the well.
	10.18.45	She wants to hear first-hand what families and children have been going through.
Shots of Rola talking to woman	10.18.50	ROLA subtitles I haven't heard about the massacre. Tell me about it.
	10.18.54	WOMAN subtitles Suddenly the shelling started. First a rocket hit us and many people died. Some had their legs blown off. What can I tell you? My two nephews died.
	10.19.08	More than 15 people were killed. in front of my house.
		ROLA subtitles Did the kids see it?
		WOMAN subtitles They were there, they saw it.
Boxes in clinic, Rola and boy carry them in	10.18.18	MUSIC

	10.19.25	ROLA subtitles Let's go this way. This is heavy.
	10.19.31	NARRATOR There are fifty people living in the school.
Rola and children in the school		ROLA Bravo, high Five.
CU Youssef Zeytoun	10.19.46	NARRATOR Youssef Zeytoun is eighty-five years old and he's been left with nothing.
Youssef Zeytoun and Rola and others in room	10.19.51	His home has gone, his family dispersed and his health is deteriorating.
CU Youssef Zeytoun	10.19.56	YOUSEF subtitles All we want is to stay alive. We keep moving from one place to another. We don't have the strength for this anymore.
CU woman	10.20.06	ROLA He's just saying that their village was attacked 3 months ago and they had to leave with just the clothes on their backs.
CU Rola		
CU child		These are all their families moved on mass here.
CU Youssef Zeytoun	10.20.20	NARRATOR The old man can barely see – he has diabetes but he hasn't been able to get his medicine since the war began.

CU child	10.20.27	WOMAN subtitles Our kids haven't gone to school for 2 years.
		ROLA Two years.
		WOMAN No school?
	10.20.32	ROLA No school. For two years.
CU woman		Nothing at all, no education whatsoever
CU Rola		saying that they've had no immunisations also for 2 years.
CU child	10.20.42	
	10.20.44	NARRATOR Now the village wants to reopen the school.
Shots of people at the school		They've been told they've got four days to leave.
	10.20.51	WOMAN And where will all the people go that live here?
CU Youssef Zeytoun		ROLA I don't know
MCU Rola in yard	10.20.59	ROLA I was quite blown away by the elderly gentleman's emotion.
Youssef Zeytoun sitting in corner of room		The food basket although is better than
CU Youssef Zeytoun		nothing is such a drop in the ocean, isn't

MCU Rola in yard	10.21.19	it, it's, it's not a home, it's not your health, it's not your medication you need, it's not your dignity back it's not your broken heart mended.
	10.21.30	MUSIC
	10.21.30	ROLA I'm quite scared of what we're going to see in the rest of the schools now - but we better go.
Rola leaves the school yard	10.21.38	ROLA subtitles Let's go.
	10.21.41	NARRATOR The Doctors keep getting moved on. Their guards are worried that if they stay anywhere too long, they'll become a target.
Shots of Rola walking along road, meets group of children in street She enters a building	10.21.51	The next stop is at a new children's hospital set up by the charity. Rola wants to check supplies and see what level of care the mums and babies are getting.
Shots of Rola at hospital - and leaving after bang	10.22.01	ROLA Where is it... shall we go down the stairs? So we've cut the ward round a little bit short, because an artillery shell apparently, it was a very loud bang.
	10.22.17	NARRATOR An artillery shell has landed near the hospital. Our guards come into the hospital to tell us to leave..

10.22.24 **ROLA**
That sounded quite close. Sounds like it probably went down very close to where we were distributing our food baskets earlier.

10.22.32 **WOMAN**
All the babies are coming round. Mums are going, they're trying to go.

ROLA subtitles

This way please.

.

MUM subtitles

No, I want to go.

.

10.22.41 **ROLA subtitles**

Don't go outside, it's safer here.

ROLA.

She wants to go.

ROLA subtitles

Just stay a while.

.

MAN subtitles

They might shell the square.

ROLA.

She wants to try and leave to however home but I think she should just stay indoors for now while we just wait. OK. We'll go. Let's go.

	10.22.57	MUSIC
Q	10.23.02	NARRATOR It soon becomes clear that our presence is making people nervous.
Women with babies in hospital room	10.23.07	ROLA We have been asked to leave. with immediate effect due to a real concern that we have been targeted or rather the area has been targeted here or rather the area has been targeted because of us and I think that we should do that, yeah.
CU Rola		
Rola with people in the room	10.23.25	NARRATOR It's not clear what the shell was aimed at. But the UN has accused the government of systematically targeting hospitals and medics.
	10.23.33	The regime has denied this.
		IAN ... not unheard of?
CU Rola	10.23.37	ROLA It's so not unheard of, unfortunately medical facilities, hospitals, doctors have been targeted from day 1 of this war. Let's go. Ready? OK.
People leaving the hospital		
Shots in town at sunset, with birds	10.24.01	MUSIC
Shot over towns at night - distant ones with lights on, nearly one dark	10.24.15	NARRATOR At night the lights of government-controlled cities in the distance seem to

		taunt rebel-held towns, where the power has been cut.
Shots of parcels being distributed in the dark	10.24.24	At another school in the village food parcels are handed out in the dark.
	10.24.37	Some are upset that their names aren't on the list. But despite the desperation there's still warmth and a token of hospitality.
CU Rola	10.24.49	ROLA They've baked bread which is just delicious, so.
Shots at distribution centre	10.25.00	NARRATOR But fear is never far from people's minds because sometimes when the electricity goes out it's a sign that regime forces are going to strike.
	10.25.09	ROLA subtitles You know I'm originally from Homs. The world isn't aware of the disaster we're living through.
Shots of Rola talking to woman		
Shots at the centre	10.25.21	ROLA My dad's family is from a similar background to most of the people we were meeting. Maybe we open each other's wounds up because- the one who says she lost her son or her cousin or her dad and I just think of all the family members we've lost.
	10.25.40	They're sort of bringing it up to the surface and with that they sort of bring my emotions to the surface as well.

Moon at night, shells moving across sky Fade to black Shots of people at children's hospital	10.25.48	MUSIC
	10.25.59	NARRATOR Back near the Turkish border crowds gather outside a children's hospital set up by Hand in Hand.
Shots of children in hospital	10.26.08	This is the only place to get free childhood immunisations.
Shots of Rola talking with Rabia	10.26.17	While Rola's here she's approached for help. Rabia used to be a nurse – now she lives in a nearby camp with other displaced families.
	10.26.26	RABIA subtitles We've run out of medicine. There's no medical centre. They make promises, but nothing happens. It's a real tragedy.
	10.26.36	ROLA subtitles It's all right. Don't get upset. God will help.
	10.26.44	ROLA I'd love to go and see, I think we should do that.
	10.26.47	MUSIC
Shots in camp	10.26.50	NARRATOR The camp where the nurse lives has about 160 tents – housing 250 families.

	10.26.57	It's one of many squalid makeshift sites dotted around the border area.
	10.27.03	ROLA She wants me to come and see these patients here.
Shots of Rola working with children	10.27.10	MAN subtitles All the camp is sick. Come and take a look. There is a child with fever in every tent.
MCU Rola	10.27.19	ROLA They're saying that there's someone with fever, diarrhoea, headaches in pretty much every single tent. It sounds like it's pretty contagious because one family member after the other is getting unwell.
Child by water pipe		
MCU Rola		
MCU man	10.27.30	MAN subtitles It's coming from here. The septic tank flooded the entire camp.
Shots of Rola inspecting the sewage problem	10.27.35	ROLA subtitles Is this sewage from the toilets? MAN subtitles It's blocked and flooded..
	10.27.43	ROLA It smells really quite awful.
	10.27.47	MUSIC

	10.27.47	ROLA This sewage water goes all the way past the water well which is marked by that triangle of metal.
		MAN subtitles We don't' have a choice. Drink dirty water or no water at all.
Child collecting water from tank	10.28.00	NARRATOR And this is why so many children here are getting sick. Raw sewage is mixing with their only source of drinking water.
Rola with children	10.28.08	ROLA Absolutely disgusting, I'm not surprised that everyone in the tent is sick. I'm surprised not everyone is dropping down dead. I mean, they describe multiple cases of typhoid fever.
Shots of Rola at camp		It's very contagious.
Shots at camp	10.28.20	They've been visited and spoken to many international NGOs and nothing. I dare any of them to come and just spend just one day in this camp to live. Just one day. To see how they would like that.
MCU Rola	10.28.38	The bureaucracy of the international NGOs is incredible. I'll be having some words.
Shots in the camp	10.28.47	MUSIC
	10.28.50	NARRATOR The threat of death hangs over Syria –

		even for those whose lives have only just begun.
	10.28.58	All the more remarkable to see what's happening just two miles up the road.
Shots of baby in UV treatment box	10.29.05	The door of a dusty Portacabin opens onto a rare moment of ultra-violet brilliance.
Shots of Rola working with baby	10.29.12	ROLA Hello little one....
	10.29.14	NARRATOR A high-tech incubation unit funded by Rola's charity.
	10.29.17	ROLA Those little fingers are so small. Ah you're waking up. Big yawn and a big stretch.
CU baby in incubator	10.29.33	NARRATOR The stress and deprivation of war has led to a huge rise in premature births.
Shots of woman working with baby	10.29.39	IAN PANNELL If you hadn't managed to raise the money and you didn't establish this facility...
CU Rola	10.29.45	ROLA Before the hospital we just had no way of dealing with them, and a lot of them did die.
Baby in incubator	10.29.50	ROLA

		Ooh I don't think you want to eat that, darling. I don't think you want to eat that. Little one. I don't think you should eat my glove but I think you should eat, you're hungry, you're hungry, is that why you're so grumpy?
Rola with baby in incubator CU baby in incubator	10.30.05	She was born yesterday. Brand new. It's amazing to see this from an inception of an idea as it were to a full birth of a special care baby unit, that's for us it's so exciting, it's that glimmer of hope in what looks like endless sea of despair and the bit that makes you think right, it's all worth it, you know. keep going.
MCU Rola		
Sunrise over Aleppo Woman with baby Doctors in hospital	10.30.32	MUSIC
	10.30.41	NARRATOR The doctors return to the Aleppo Hospital where their journey into Syria started.
	10.30.46	No one could've imagined how this day would end....
	10.30.49	or the terrible events that would unfold.
Shots of Sal and Rola and other staff working with injured baby	10.30.54	SAL Careful. With the face don't hold the face so hard,. he's burnt. You irrigate, hold this, good hold.
	10.31.02	NARRATOR A seven month old baby boy has been brought in with severe burns. No one's quite sure what's happened.
	10.31.08	SAL Have you got a cannula? A small

		cannula for a baby, this is too big. The baby cannula, this is too big. Ooh, ooh OK.
	10.31.18	This baby needs to be picked up, are you the dad, are you the father? You sit down you hold the baby.
	10.31.25	ROLA subtitles Get me one vial of fentanyl and one of morphine.
	10.31.28	SAL This is crazy... half the kit we need I'm not getting or I don't have access to. Everything is adult size and not paediatric size.
Car arrives with injured boy	10.31.40	SAL Uh oh, OK here we have someone else. Oh my gosh!
Car arrives with injured man CU Rola	10.31.46	ROLA subtitles There are more ambulances coming.
Van arrives Shots in hospital emergency department	10.31.53	NARRATOR Some kind of air-strike seems to have taken place.
More casualties arrive	10.31.58	Most of the casualties are teenagers.
	10.32.01	They're saying a bomb has landed in their school playground.
	10.32.05	SAL There are dozens of people who have just been rushed in, covered in burns and some white powder or dust.

CU Sal		10.32.17	NARRATOR It's only five days since the chemical attack in Damascus – and everyone's terrified that there's just been another one.
Injured people arriving at the hospital		10.32.26	ROLA It's absolute chaos and carnage here, we've had an massive influx of what looks like serious burns, it seems like it must be some sort of chemical weapon, I'm not really sure.
MCU Rola		10.32.40	SAL We don't know what we're dealing with.
Injured people arriving at the hospital		10.32.43	NARRATOR Rola orders all casualties, anyone who's touched the victims, to be doused in water.
People being doused with water		10.32.58	IAN Casualties just keep on coming in. The truth is they can't even barely begin to cope inside here. There are few beds, which is why people are laid out on the floor. One thing that the camera will not tell you is the smell in the air.
More injured people arrive		10.33.12	It's the sickening smell of burning flesh, it's an absolutely horrific scene. The hospital staff are now handing these out because of course the fear is they don't know what's happened and they think it
MCU Ian Pannell PTC in hospital			

		maybe a chemical attack.
Ian Pannell puts mask on and walks out of shot, leaving doctors treating injured people	10.33.31	NARRATOR There were no shrapnel injuries or loss of blood typical of most aerial bombs.
	10.33.35	Instead it caused napalm-like burns consistent with an incendiary device – rather than a chemical weapon.
Ahmed comes in to the room...	10.33.45	Thirteen-year-old Ahmed is in shock. He's one of the youngest victims to come in.
... but has to wait in the corridor	10.33.52	The emergency ward is full so he's told to wait in the corridor.
More injured people arrive	10.34.08	Within minutes the hospital is overwhelmed.
Shots in the hospital	10.34.13	ROLA subtitles Let's take these off. Wait until I move her. One, two, three. It's OK brother.
	10.34.20	SAL He looks like he is 13, 14 or 15 years old, just a kid. WOMAN How will you treat it?
	10.34.32	NARRATOR With their emergency experience, Rola and Saleyha take charge – dealing with the most serious cases.

	10.34.38	ROLA Let me do that, get an IV line in him if you can.
	10.34.43	SAL Oh, oh my goodness, looking bad. Oh my goodness. So we know we are in coz the chest wall is rising, so that's fine. OK OK OK.
	10.34.56	ROLA subtitles Get anyone who isn't a patient out of here. Get them all out of here.
Sal with people outside	10.35.03	SAL Has he had any painkillers? Painkiller? Morphine? OK That's better than nothing. OK.
And with patient inside		
Shots in the hospital	10.35.10	ROLA subtitles Who's handling the oxygen? Get me that monitor. BOY subtitles Cover me. Cover me.
	10.35.18	SAL How are we doing with the painkillers?
Sal with people outside	10.35.29	I think there's more coming. As you can see it's just chaos,
Rola with people outside	10.35.45	He's already tubed, he's already tubed, it's fine.. He needs someone to be

		supporting his airway.
CU Rola outside	10.35.53	ROLA We can do first aid, we can provide analgesia and any resuscitation required, but no specific treatment.
Man arrives with injured daughter	10.36.05	MAN subtitles This is my daughter.
	10.36.09	MUSIC
Ambulance arrives Shots in the hospital	10.36.52	BOY Hurts so bad, so bad.
		SAL I know you are, but you're in the right place, you're in the right place, OK.
	10.36.57	MUSIC
	10.37.03	GIRL subtitles Leave me alone. Daddy.
Siham in hospital	10.37.09	NARRATOR Eighteen year old Siham had been sat in her maths class when the blast ripped through the window.
Rola and man, Rola working with Siham	10.37.17	MAN subtitles I beg you. treat her like your own daughter.
		ROLA subtitles Please stand aside so I can work.

		MAN subtitles
		Careful, hold her arm.
Shots in hospital	10.37.31	SAL I'm improvising in ways that I've never been forced to do because of lack of equipment.
	10.37.37	You know, as you can see there is nothing coming up on this foot for me to put a cannula in.
	10.37.48	Oh this is heart-breaking.
	10.367.53	ROLA We most of the people have got 70-90% burns, they will start to lose a lot of fluid, some of them will start to have difficulty breathing,
CU Rola	10.38.01	and they will need intensive care therapy basically, which we are no able to provide in the context of a field hospital.
Injured person being moved on stretcher	10.38.06	They will have to go to Turkey through Bab-al-Hawa and be referred on from there.
Sal and Rola and other staff working with injured boy	10.38.13	SAL They all need transfer, they are all 50 and above, 54, he's 86.
	10.38.20	ROLA OK.
Ambulances being loaded at night Woman crying on step in dark		So fine, so first 2 ambulances are going.
	10.38.33	MUSIC
Rola on roof of building with view over town She lights a cigarette		

Ambulance being loaded at night	10.38.55	ROLA I thought it was just never going to end, we lost a gentlemen on transfer to Bab-Al-Hawa. I've never seen a burn that bad.
CU Rola		I think his face is going to stay with me for quite a long time.
INT hospital corridor	10.39.17	SAL Today was like something out of flippin' Armageddon. Out of all the war zones that I've ever been to, today has been by the worst.
Sal sitting on stairs	10.39.29	I have never seen anything like that, the fact that they were children, teenagers, same ages as my nieces and nephews.
CU Sal		
CU Rola	10.39.39	ROLA I feel so angry right now, I feel so, so angry.
	10.39.55	The whole world has been watching us for two and a half years.
High shot over ambulances being loaded	10.40.07	We feel like some sort of, not even a second class citizen, like we just don't matter, like of all these children and all of these people who are being killed and massacred, we don't matter.
CU Rola		
Woman crying on step in dark	10.40.25	The whole world has failed our nation and it's innocent civilians who are paying the price.
CU Rola	10.40.34	It's an absolute disgrace on the United Nations and all of humanity.
Rola silhouetted against sky		
Fade to black		

Shots of wrecked school	10.40.55	MUSIC
	10.41.02	NARRATOR Two days later we reached the school.
	10.41.07	People say they saw a plane circling above.
Headmaster enters school compound through gate	10.41.16	The headmaster is still too afraid to show his face.
	10.41.22	The smell at the scene and the debris suggest it
Shots of wrecked school		WAS an incendiary bomb.
	10.41.29	Not a chemical weapon but a conventional one. More than a hundred countries have banned their use against civilians.
	10.41.38	But not Syria.
	10.41.39	MUSIC
	10.41.41	TEACHER subtitles In this yard they used to sit and play. The worst thing in life is.
Headmaster silhouetted against sun		for someone to die before our eyes.
Shots of wrecked school		People burning in front of you. people dying. people running.
	10.42.04	But where will they run to? They're not safe anywhere.
Headmaster silhouetted against sun Fade to black		This is the fate of the Syrian people.
	10.42.14	MUSIC
Slomo shot in hospital corridor	10.42.20	NARRATOR With appalling injuries and limited medical care – some of the teenagers

		didn't survive.
MCU Mohammed Khanas injured in hospital	10.42.27	Mohammed Khanas, 14 years old. He died on the way to hospital in Turkey.
Anas Sayyed Ali injured in hospital	10.43.35	Anas Sayyed Ali, 18. He'd been waiting to pick up his little sister from school.
Lutfi Arsi injured in hospital	10.42.43	And 14 year old Lutfi Arsi, who was in the playground when the bomb landed.
	10.42.49	Three of the ten children who died.
Ahmed Darwish injured in hospital	10.42.54	Thirteen year old Ahmed Darwish was described as a hard working student – with a smiley face – he DID survive.
Ahmed Darwish in hospital in Turkey	10.43.05	We found him a few weeks after the attack in hospital in Turkey with forty percent burns to his body.
Siham Kanbari injured in hospital	10.43.15	NARRATOR Eighteen year old Siham Kanbari was in her final year of school – one of the smartest in her class.
Siham Kanbari in hospital in Turkey		She's also in Turkey for treatment – with seventy percent burns.
CU Ahmed in hospital bed	10.43.34	AHMED subtitles Pain,.. Just pain. I'm in a lot of pain.
	10.43.42	I had a fever all last night. Now my neck and shoulder really hurt.
Siham Kanbari hospital bed	10.43.51	SIHAM subtitles Please let it be over now. We have to find a way out. We've had all we can take.
	10.44.02	MUSIC

	10.44.04	AHMED subtitles Why bomb us when we are at school. Why?
Fade to black		
High shot over camp at sunset		
Shots in camp	10.44.18	NARRATOR The controversy over chemical weapons has died down.
	10.44.24	But the suffering doesn't stop and the killing doesn't end.
High shot over camp	10.44.31	Rola and Saleyha have now left Syria and are back at work in British hospitals.
2 people in tent in camp at night, with candle	10.44.37	It's only the efforts of the few that brings any relief to a nation beset by despair.
People round fire in camp	10.44.45	And to the millions of children here who're alone and forgotten.
Roll end credits	10.44.51	